Peer Review - Maxine Graves

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Title  Clear, Interesting, Focused | Interesting and brief title that captures important information | 5 pts |
| Author/Contact Info  Your name and email addr. | Well done | 0 pts |
| Abstract  Summarizes I,D,M,R,D in 3-6 brief clear sentences. | All sections are summarized and key ideas are presented.  A more generalized sentence summarizing Introduction and Results section could be used. | 5 pts |
| Introduction  Brief, clear, to the point; context for the problem; What is the problem/aim of the study? What questions will be answered? | The introduction satisfies the requirement and research questions are presented specifically and clearly. | 10 pts |
| Data  How was the data generated? By whom? Variable definitions, sample size, quick numerical summaries of the variables and initial EDA. Don't forget to add some sentences/paragraphs explaining everything! | Using a table to present the summaries of the variables is a smart idea;  Maybe consider presenting histograms of all variables instead of the just the right skewed ones in order to better demonstrate the data overall | 5 pts |
| Methods  List the methods and/or analyses that will be used to answer each question stated in the Introduction. No data analysis, graphing, model fitting, etc. appears here | Extremely clear to list the methods in bullet points. No extra information is given.  Maybe mention/repeat the research questions briefly again because the readers need to scroll back up to recall the research questions. | 5 pts |
| Results  Statistical analysis & results in order parallel to Intro & Methods; no new methods or data; no big picture discussion | Research questions are all answered perfectly using statistical analysis and results presented.  Again I think the research questions could be repeated so readers do not need to scroll back up to see what the research questions are; also, maybe just present the highlighted scatterplots and put the rest into the appendix | 10 pts |
| Discussion  Recap findings; address main problem/question; strengths & weaknesses; implications, unanswered questions, future research | Concise summary of findings. Future directions of the research are also looked into.  Some evaluations might be needed to address the strengths and weaknesses of the models. | 10 pts |
| Mechanics  Follows C-C-C as much as possible (sentences, paragraphs & sections); Grammatical; Easy to follow | Sentences are easy to follow! Everything is grammatically correct | 5 pts |
| Statistical Content  Correctly and appropriately uses technical and non-technical material we have learned in class. Easy to follow; Analysis makes sense/not crazy (roughly 10% per research question) | Analysis is appropriate and addresses the questions. | 40 pts |
| References & Citations  Follow ASA guide, “The Reference List” & “Reference Citations” (be sure to cite all sources!) | Nothing more to improve on | 5 pts |
| Technical Appendix  Helps me to understand your paper and give you max points above; Easy to follow. Complete analyses: R code, output, graphs, tables, and comments explaining what you did and why. | The appendix is helpful and easy to follow. It also has a format similar to lab report with some sentences addressing the plots/analysis |  |